

Summary of *Lagleva v. Doyle*

The latest: Community activists in Northern California sued Marin County Sheriff Robert Doyle in October 2021 for illegally sharing millions of local drivers' license plate numbers and location data, captured by a network of cameras his office uses, with federal and out-of-state law enforcement agencies—a practice that violates two California laws, endangers the safety and privacy of local immigrant communities, and facilitates location tracking by police.

The suit seeks to end this illegal practice, which gives law enforcement outside California access to a massive amount of sensitive personal information of drivers who've violated no law, revealing where they live and work, when they visit friends or drop their kids off at school, and when they attend religious services or protests.

What Happens in Marin County

The sheriff collects massive amounts of location information of drivers who have no choice but to travel by car through Marin County on a daily basis, and then shares and transfers that sensitive personal information across the country to agencies not subject to the important privacy protections imposed by the California legislature. This violates two state laws: SB34 and SB 54 (also known as the California Values Act).

Why This is a Problem in Marin

ALPRs are an invasive mass surveillance technology. Short of choosing not to drive, there is no way for a person traveling within Marin County to be sure their location information will not be caught up in the Sheriff's ALPR surveillance web. Yet many Marin County residents have no choice but to drive for everyday life because Marin County is a car-dependent series of communities spread across 828 square miles.

Who are the Plaintiffs?

Plaintiffs are longtime members of the Marin County community. They are committed advocates for immigrant justice, racial justice and equity, and the human and civil rights of Marin County residents. They drive daily throughout Marin County. Plaintiffs frequently protest the Sheriff's practices that harm the rights of immigrant and marginalized community members. They have pursued their advocacy in multiple ways, including by meeting with the Sheriff's Office, providing public comment to the County's Board of Supervisors, publishing news articles and op-eds, and organizing community forums. But the Sheriff has not heard their concerns.

What do the Plaintiffs seek to accomplish through this suit?

Plaintiffs seek to end the sheriff's sharing and transfer of ALPR information with out-of-state and federal entities. The plaintiffs are trying to make Marin a safe and welcoming place for all if its community members, including immigrants.

How does ALPR surveillance work?

An ALPR camera automatically captures color images of license plates of drivers that pass within its field of view, without any suspicion of drivers' wrongdoing. Software extracts the license plate numbers from the images and stores the images, license plate numbers, precise dates, times, and GPS coordinates of the image captures in a searchable database. Government agents can easily

search the database storing ALPR information. They may search for a full license plate number to locate a specific vehicle, search for a partial license plate number to locate a group of vehicles, or search for all vehicles recorded at a particular location at specific times. A single ALPR camera can capture the locations of thousands of drivers in a short time, all without any human involvement. For example, the Sacramento County Sheriff's Office once captured 1.7 million plates in one week, according to a 2020 California State Auditor report.

What are the risks of ALPR surveillance?

ALPR systems radically decrease the personnel and equipment costs necessary for government authorities to effortlessly surveil drivers *en masse*, removing a traditional check on government power and permitting the dragnet and continuous surveillance of entire communities that did not and could not exist before the invention of modern surveillance systems. By tracking where people are across time, ALPR information can reveal a person's private habits, movements, and associations, in violation of the Fourth Amendment. The human cost of such surveillance is vast: in the hands of abusive and racially discriminatory agencies, like CBP, ICE and the police, this technology will lead to more state violence, deportations, and incarceration.

Why is this issue important?

- The use of surveillance technology has alarming implications for Black, immigrants, and other communities of color. This technology does not offer a benign alternative to abusive policing; it only expands and accelerates incarceration and deportation.
- All people should be able to go about their daily lives and enjoy the privacy rights guaranteed by the Constitution. The government should not have unfettered access to information that reveals where we live, where we work, and our private habits.
- It is appalling that the sheriff is sharing peoples' private information with two of the most rogue and immoral agencies in the federal government: Customs and Border Protection and Immigration and Customs Enforcement. Both have an egregious track record of terrorizing communities, separating children from parents, detaining immigrants, and unnecessarily wasting taxpayer funds.
- The sheriff should not be exposing our community to federal immigration agents. Sheriff Boyle needs to answer for why he is helping federal agencies who have a mission to find and deport our loved ones and neighbors.
- Immigrants are at the heart of our communities – they are our coworkers, family members, and friends. Public safety means taking care of all people in Marin, not using a high-powered mass surveillance technology that violates our rights and tears people away from their homes.